

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO  
WESTERN DIVISION**

**RLI INSURANCE COMPANY**

Plaintiff

vs.

**FIFTH THIRD BANCORP**

Defendant

---

**FIFTH THIRD BANCORP, an Ohio Corporation, and FIFTH THIRD BANK, an Ohio Banking Corporation**

Plaintiff

vs.

**CERTAIN UNDERWRITERS AT LLOYD'S SUBSCRIBING TO POLICY B0509QA048710, B0509QA051310, 81906760, et al.**

Defendants

: Civil Action No. **1:14cv802**

:  
:

: Judge: **Sandra S. Beckwith**

: Magistrate: **Stephanie K. Bowman**

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

: Civil Action No. **1:14cv869**

:  
:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED,

/S/ Mark J. Byrne

**MARK J. BYRNE (0029243)**

**KENNETH F. SEIBEL (0025168)**

JACOBS, KLEINMAN, SEIBEL & McNALLY

Cincinnati Club Building

30 Garfield Place

Cincinnati, OH 45202

Phone: (513) 381-6600

Fax: (513) 381-4150

Email: mbyrne@jksmlaw.com

kseibel@jksmlaw.com

*Trial Counsel for Defendant Fifth Third Bancorp  
and Plaintiff Fifth Third Bancorp and  
Third Bank*

/S/ Charles E. Turnbull

**CHARLES E. TURNBULL (P29420)**

**LAWRENCE M. SCOTT (P30228)**

**MARC D. KASZUBSKI (P60333)**

O'REILLY RANCILIO P.C.

12900 Hall Road, Suite 350

Sterling Heights, MI 48313

Phone: (586) 726-1000

Fax: (586) 726-1560

Email: cturnbull@orlaw.com

lscott@orlaw.com

mkaszubski@orlaw.com

*Co-Counsel for Defendant Fifth Third Bancorp  
and Plaintiff Fifth Third Bancorp and  
Third Bank*

## **MEMORANDUM**

Case No. 1:14cv869 is a breach of contract action for damages caused by the fraudulent acts of Fifth Third's former employee, Matthew P. Ross ("Ross"), and the alleged failure of the Defendants Certain Underwriters at Lloyd's Subscribing to Policy Numbers B0509QA048710, B0509QA051310 and 81906760, AXIS Insurance Company, Ace Insurance Company, Federal

Insurance Company Continental Insurance Company, Fidelity and Deposit Insurance Company, and St. Paul Mercury Insurance Company to pay Fifth Third's alleged losses pursuant to the terms of three Financial Institution Bonds that cover the losses. Fifth Third seeks indemnification and reimbursement for their losses and expenses it claims were caused by Ross and based upon the Defendants' respective obligations under the Financial Institution Bonds.

Similarly, Case No. 1:14cv802, RLI Insurance Company ("RLI") seeks a declaratory judgment action against Fifth Third Bancorp regarding Fifth Third's claim against RLI for a loss Fifth Third sustained due to alleged dishonest acts committed by Ross. The alleged dishonest acts in this case resulted in a counterclaim by Fifth Third against RLI pursuant to financial bonds issued by RLI.

Pursuant to Southern District of Ohio Civil Rule 3.1(b), Fifth Third's counsel identified Case No. 1:14cv802 as a related case to Case No. 1:14cv869 because the cases: (1) arise from the same or substantially identical transactions, happenings, or events; (2) call for a determination of the same or substantially identical questions of law and fact; (3) would entail a substantial duplication of effort and expense by the Court and the parties if heard by different judges; (4) seek relief that could result in a party being subject to conflicting orders of this Court. Both cases were assigned to Judge Beckwith's docket. Judge Beckwith determined that the cases are related and they shall both remain on her docket. (Case No. 1:14cv869) (Doc. 7).

Rule 42(a) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure provides that the Court may consolidate actions that involve common questions of law or fact. Both cases involve common questions of law and fact. As such, Fifth Third Bancorp and Fifth Third Bank request that this Court consolidate the cases. Counsel for Continental Insurance Company, Fidelity and Deposit

Insurance Company and St. Paul Mercury Insurance Company does not oppose the motion in  
Case No. 1:14cv869.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED,

/S/ Mark J. Byrne

---

**MARK J. BYRNE (0029243)**

**KENNETH F. SEIBEL (0025168)**

JACOBS, KLEINMAN, SEIBEL & McNALLY

Cincinnati Club Building

30 Garfield Place

Cincinnati, OH 45202

Phone: (513) 381-6600

Fax: (513) 381-4150

Email: mbyrne@jksmlaw.com

kseibel@jksmlaw.com

*Trial Counsel for Defendant Fifth Third Bancorp  
and Plaintiff Fifth Third Bancorp and  
Third Bank*

/S/ Charles E. Turnbull

---

**CHARLES E. TURNBULL (P29420)**

**LAWRENCE M. SCOTT (P30228)**

**MARC D. KASZUBSKI (P60333)**

O'REILLY RANCILIO P.C.

12900 Hall Road, Suite 350

Sterling Heights, MI 48313

Phone: (586) 726-1000

Fax: (586) 726-1560

Email: cturnbull@orlaw.com

lscott@orlaw.com

mkaszubski@orlaw.com

*Co-Counsel for Defendant Fifth Third Bancorp  
and Plaintiff Fifth Third Bancorp and  
Third Bank*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on December 19, 2014, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF System, which will send notification of such filing to the following:

*Attorneys for RLI Insurance Company:*

Robert W. Hojnoski, Esquire  
Reminger Co., LPA  
525 Vine Street, Suite 1700  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
Email: rhojnoski@reminger.com

Carrie M. Starts, Esquire  
Reminger Co., LPA  
525 Vine Street, Suite 1700  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
Email: cstarts@reminger.com

Nathan A. Lennon, Esquire  
Reminger Co., LPA  
525 Vine Street, Suite 1700  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
Email: nlennon@reminger.com

Scott L. Schmookler, Esquire  
Gordon & Rees, LLP  
One North Franklin, Suite 8800  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Email: sschmookler@gordonrees.com

Regina A. Ripley, Esquire  
Gordon & Rees, LLP  
One North Franklin, Suite 8800  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Email: rripley@gordonrees.com

Ji-Yeon Suh, Esquire  
Gordon & Rees, LLP  
One North Franklin, Suite 8800  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Email: jsuh@gordonrees.com

*Attorneys for Continental Insurance Company, Fidelity and Deposit  
Insurance Company, and St. Paul Mercury Insurance Company:*

Luke J. Busam, Esquire  
Frost Brown Todd LLC  
3300 Great American Tower  
301 E. Fourth Street  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
Email: lbusam@fbtlaw.com

Bryan S. Strawbridge, Esquire  
Frost Brown Todd, LLC  
201 N. Illinois Street, Suite 1900  
P.O. Box 44961  
Indianapolis, IN 46244-0961  
Email: bstrawbridge@fbtlaw.com

Julia Blackwell Galina's  
Frost Brown Todd, LLC  
201 N. Illinois Street, Suite 1900  
P.O. Box 44961  
Indianapolis, IN 46244-0961  
Email: jgelinas@fbtlaw.com

I further certify that on the December 9, 2014, the foregoing has been forwarded via ordinary United States Mail to the following:

*Certain Underwriters at Lloyd's*

Certain Underwriters at Lloyd's  
c/o Mendes and Mount, LLP  
750 Seventh Avenue  
New York, NY 10019-6829  
*(Contractual Designee for Service)*

and

Certain Underwriters at Lloyd's  
c/o Lloyd's of London  
1211 Avenue of the Americas, 24<sup>th</sup> Flr.  
New York, NY 10036

and

John W. Blancett, Esquire  
Christopher J. Losquadro, Esquire  
Sedgwick LLP  
Brookfield Place  
225 Liberty Street, 28<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10281-1008  
Email: John.Blancett@sedgwicklaw.com  
Christopher.Losquadro@sedgwicklaw.com  
*Attorneys for Certain Underwriters at Lloyd's Subscribing  
To Policy Numbers B0509QA048710, B0509QA051310  
and 8190676*

*AXIS Insurance Company*

AXIS Insurance Company  
c/o Mendes and Mount, LLP  
750 Seventh Avenue  
New York, NY 10019-6829  
(Contractual Designee for Service)

and

AXIS Insurance Company  
11680 Great Oaks Way, Suite 500  
Alpharetta, GA 30022

*Ace Insurance Company*

Ace Insurance Company  
c/o Mendes and Mount, LLP  
750 Seventh Avenue  
New York, NY 10019-6829  
(Contractual Designee for Service)

and

Ace Insurance Company  
1133 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, NY 10036

*Federal Insurance Company*

Federal Insurance Company  
c/o Mendes and Mount, LLP  
750 Seventh Avenue  
New York, NY 10019-6829  
*(Contractual Designee for Service)*

and

Federal Insurance Company  
15 Mountain View Road  
Warren, NJ 07059

/S/ Mark J. Byrne

**MARK J. BYRNE (0029243)**

*Trial Counsel for Defendant Fifth Third Bancorp  
and Plaintiff Fifth Third Bancorp and  
Third Bank*